The Multiculturalism Practice in Trend, Factors and Adaptation of Employment of People with Disabilities: A systematic review

Noria Ab Karim and Siti Aishah Hassan
Department of Counselor Education and Counseling Psychology, Faculty of Educational Studies, Universiti Putra Malaysia, 43400 Serdang, Selangor, Malaysia

ABSTRACT
People with disabilities are acknowledged as part of multiculturalism in term of the diversity in their abilities. The aspect of acceptance, fairness, indiscrimination and freedom are counted in deciding whether the equality concept in multiculturalism being practiced or not. This article is a systematic review study which explores equality practice in employment of people with disabilities. Electronic database, ScienceDirect, is used to search relevant reading materials and 10 journals are found by considering the inclusion and exclusion criteria. The review is derived systematically from the trend of employment among people with disabilities, the factors that affect the chances of employment and the adaptation of the people with disabilities in the world of work. Findings show that the main factor that is essential for employment opportunity is the type of disability. Implication for the workplace to accommodate includes modified working hours, modified duties and human support.

Keywords: Multiculturalism principle, employment, people with disabilities, systematic review

INTRODUCTION
People with disabilities are acknowledged as part of multiculturalism which can be defined as diversity of cultures in globalized world related to ethnicity, race, socio-cultural groups, gender, sexual preferences and relation between majority and minorities (1). Consideration of any cultural group as equivalent is the basic principle of multiculturalism where there are elements of acceptance in cultural diversity, fairness in job possibilities, elimination of discrimination and prejudices as well as freedom for everyone to seek space for self-fulfillment, adjustment and satisfaction (2-5).

As one of the minority’s group, individual with disabilities can be broadly described as person having impairment or health condition that limits his or her participation in critical or heavy activities such as working (6). This group of people contribute about 15% or one billion of the world population (7). The type of disabilities can be varied from developmental disabilities, intellectual disabilities, physical disabilities, sensory impairment and several more. Some types of disabilities are related with ageing in which the increasing number of elderly people cause the increment in number of people with disabilities (8).

In recent years, there is growing in interest of international policy on employment of disabilities (9-10). The employment in general is very important for adults either at individual level or societal level as it can leads to source of income, source of social support and it also can provides structure which improves quality of life. People need to feel that they are important to others and there is meaning in what they are doing. This is no exception for people with disabilities in fact, such aspects are even more important for them though it depends on the type of disability (11).

Besides that, there are also young adults that in need of attention to consider their future prospects because they already living with disabilities, and the children as well as the adolescents who are quickly turning into adulthood (12). Despite of the rising of concern about promoting employment of people with disabilities, the rate of employment among them remains low. Silva and Vall-Castelly (13) reported that presence of lower level of productivity among disabled individuals deter them from looking for jobs. The accomplishment-limiting mental health and the activity-limiting physical health issues also significantly affect the tendency of disabled people to be employed (14).

Nevertheless, this issue is being addressed effectively by the responsible parties all over the world. Thus, come out with alternatives like skills training, creating employment designed specifically for people with disabilities and formal education for disabled people (15-16). The implementation will be more beneficial.
for individuals that practice it by being employed. Study discussed by Abdullah and Eng (17) stated that the ratings of communication skills were significantly higher in employed respondents than their unemployed counterparts.

As discussed earlier, the principle of multiculturalism is applicable for people with disabilities. Thus, the concept of equivalent is expected to be presence in term of employment opportunities. This systematic review study would be a screening method (18) by considering the elements of acceptance, fairness, indiscrimination and freedom in the employment of people with disabilities.

The aim of this review is to explore the existence of multiculturalism principle practice in employment of the disabilities based on the trend, factors and adaptation of employment. Findings were tabulated systematically based on the case studies reported for the employment of people with disabilities. The findings were presented according to the questions below which also provide some ideas of the context of review.

1. What is the current trend in employment of disabilities? This question leads to the search of pattern in employment of disabled people with aim to address the element of acceptance among cultural diversity. The search of pattern or trend is focused on the statistical data.

2. What factors that have impact on the chances of employment for disabilities? This question seeks for either positively or negatively impact factors on the chances of employment. The factors reflect the fairness or discrimination of people towards employees or colleagues with disabilities.

3. How this group of people able to adapt themselves in the world of work? The focus is to find out any suggestion, recommendation or reason that can help in maintaining the disabled people in their employment. These aspects can be related as the space provided for self-fulfillment of disabled people at the workplace.

**METHOD**

The systematic review was started by searching topic area of interest through a database. A few keywords are used for the searching purpose focusing in the area of interest that is disabilities. A specific search strategy has been planned in order to retrieve relevancy literatures to address the objective of this review.

**The search strategy**

The searching of the literature was done in ScienceDirect database which has been accessed under ezproxy website of Universiti Putra Malaysia, UPM. Two key indicators are used to obtain the extended list of literatures which are employment and disabilities. In order to increase the effectiveness of the searching process, several inclusion criteria and exclusion criteria are being applied to the search result as shown in Table I and Table II. The article type is focused to be the research articles type only and the accessibility of the article is chose to be open access type only. All of the literatures are retrieved within the range of year 2013 until 2018. More details on the search term in the ScienceDirect database are presented in Table I.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table I: Inclusion and exclusion criteria of the systematic review.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inclusion criteria presented in order</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Article type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access type</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year of publication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title or abstract screening</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Exclusion criteria presented in order</strong></th>
<th><strong>Particulars</strong></th>
<th><strong>Literatures identified</strong></th>
<th><strong>Remaining literature</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion criteria</td>
<td>18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full text assessment</td>
<td>Irrelevant intervention</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Irrelevant outcome</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unsuitable article type</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 1: Flowchart of the systematic review.** The flowchart in Figure 1 shows a clearer flow of every search that is reproducible.
The searching by using the key words yield the highest number of journals found in the database. The searching criteria is then being narrowed down according to the inclusion and exclusion criteria. The search ended after the collection of journals are at satisfactory level. All of the desired journals are saved in pdf format by using Adobe Acrobat Document. Each of the journal is studied, reviewed and the findings are tabulated in Table II. The flowchart for this systematic review was started with the search of key word, followed by the type of article, the access type of the article, year of publication, the title and abstract screening, language and full-text assessment. The flowchart in Figure 1 represents a clearer flow of every search that is reproducible.

From the search of disabilities AND employment, 40 513 journals are listed in the database. After minimize the choice of article type into research article only, 24 516 journals are found. Then, by filtering the accessibility of the article to open access only, the search result for the number of journals become 2 020. By choosing the choice of article type into research article only, 24 516 journals are listed in the database. After minimize the number of journals reduced into 167 journals (2013), 275 journals (2014), 311 journals (2015), 264 journals (2016), 234 journals (2017) and 99 journals (2018). Then, the title and abstract screening was performed and only total of 18 journals being selected within the year 2013 until 2018.

For the next step, the review is further limited with several exclusion criteria. One of the remaining literatures is excluded based on the language which is Spanish. After that, the other 7 number of journals are excluded due to irrelevance in the intervention and outcome of studies and unsuitability of article type to be reviewed. This exclusion is performed after full text assessment of the journals. Finally, only 10 number of journals remained to be used in this systematic review.

**Findings of literature review**

The data presented in Table III is the statistical data of disabilities employment which can better explained the trend of employment among disabilities. In addition, the data also reflect on the acceptance principle in population with diverse culture.

Referring to Table II, the information tabulated is regarding the summaries of literatures using five categories which are author, country, setting, sample and relevant findings. The findings are focused on the factors

### Table II: Summary of selected literatures.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>Sample (n=participant)</th>
<th>Relevant findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Thapanalan (19)</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>Small industry or small business</td>
<td>Employees (n=60)</td>
<td>The factors that affect the employment of person with mental illness by the employers either in service industry or retail trade industry are the concern on workplace performance and work personality. By exposing the employers to a comprehensive education about person with mental illness, supportive work environment could be established which will be the reason for these people to adapt in their work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kocaalan (16)</td>
<td>Turkey</td>
<td>Café concept business</td>
<td>Individuals with Down Syndrome (n=14)</td>
<td>For Down’s syndrome individuals to take part in the employment market, status of disability and which line of work that the disabilities can gain supervene become the factors. A good system in the workplace which allow the disabilities to feel good about themselves, to participate spiritually and provide opportunities for creation of financial gain will help in adaptation at the workplace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guimarães et al. (7)</td>
<td>Brazil</td>
<td>Construction industry</td>
<td>People with disabilities (n=43)</td>
<td>The research identified that gender and type of disabilities are factors that give impact to the possibility of employment. Workers adaptation is improved with the adjustment made in organizational way such as disabled people just carry out light work, work that not involved height and no need to handle heavy object or tools.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yusuf et al. (20)</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>Vocational school leavers with disabilities (n=99)</td>
<td>The employment of vocational school leavers with disabilities should depends on the type of disability and type of trained vocational skills. Appropriate job market that suits the disabled individuals’ skill need to be reviewed so that their adaptation towards the work can be improved.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yusuf et al. (10)</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>Service industries</td>
<td>Employers (n=3)</td>
<td>Factor of personality like responsible, hardworking, honest, compliant and social ability can increase chances of employment while low self-confident, easily tempted by negative elements and very sensitive have reverse impact on employment. Other important factor is work skill. Monitoring during working and repeated learning process if new training being implemented lead to better adaptation of people of disabilities at work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abdul Latib and Rajuddin (13)</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
<td>Special vocational training institutions and sheltered workshops</td>
<td>Trainees with Physical Disabilities (n=153)</td>
<td>Factor for physically disabled trainees in institutions or workshops to be employed can be based on the Employment Core Abilities Skills (ECAS). By knowing the level of workers’ ECAS, employers can provide training, adjustment or support that can accommodate the people with disabilities at the workplace.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zwicker et al. (21)</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>Population of Canadians with self-reported developmental disability, cerebral palsy and autism spectrum disorder (n=4359)</td>
<td>Self-perception of being disadvantaged in the workplace gives negative impact in the rate of employment. In order to meet the need of workplace accommodation, employers have to aware the limitation of people with disabilities. The workplace accommodation includes modified working hours, modified duties and human support.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boman et al. (11)</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>Swedish labour market</td>
<td>Respondents with disabilities (n=143)</td>
<td>The main factor that is essential for employment opportunity is the type of disability. Besides that, gender, age, self-estimated ability to work and level of education also have implication on the employment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mizonoya and Mitra (22)</td>
<td>Not specified</td>
<td>15 developing countries: Africa (7), Asia (4) and South America (4)</td>
<td>Population aged 18 until 60</td>
<td>The employment rate is based on the factor of disability status and gender.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bush and Tasmi (23)</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
<td>Community-based workplace and facility-based workplace</td>
<td>3 groups of adults with intellectual disability: Autism spectrum disorder (n=2174), Down syndrome (n=1807), Idiopathic (n=15845)</td>
<td>The employment of adults with intellectual disability depends on the severity level of intellectual disability, short term choice making, age and work setting. The choice making is important component for these people to have self-determination. Having self-determination can help in better adaptation in work place.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
that have impact on the chances of employment among disabilities and reason, suggestion or recommendation that can help people with disabilities adapt with their employment.

The factors that affect the employment of person with mental illness by the employers either in service industry or retail trade industry are the concern on workplace performance and work personality. By exposing the employers to a comprehensive education about person with mental illness, supportive work environment could be established which will be the reason for these people to adapt in their work.

For Down’s syndrome individuals to take part in the employment market, status of disability and which line of work that the disabilities can gain supremacy become the factors. A good system in the workplace which allow the disabilities to feel good about themselves, to participate spiritually and provide opportunities for creation of financial gain will help in adaptation at the workplace.

The research identified that gender and type of disabilities are factors that give impact to the possibility of employment. Workers adaptation is improved with the adjustment made in organizational way such as disabled people just carry out light work, work that not involved height and no need to handle heavy object or tools.

The employment of vocational school leavers with disabilities should depends on the type of disability and type of trained vocational skills. Appropriate job market that suits the disabled individuals’ skill need to be reviewed so that their adaptation towards the work can be improved.

Factor of personality like responsible, hardworking, honest, compliant and social ability can increase chances of employment while low self-confident, easily tempted by negative elements and very sensitive have reverse impact on employment. Other important factor is work skill. Monitoring during working and repeated learning process if new training being implemented lead to better adaptation of people of disabilities at work.

Factor for physically disabled trainees in institutions or workshops to be employed can be based on the Employment Core Abilities Skills (ECAS). By knowing the level of workers’ ECAS, employers can provide training, adjustment or support that can accommodate the people with disabilities at the workplace.

Self-perception of being disadvantaged in the workplace gives negative impact in the rate of employment. In order to meet the need of workplace accommodation, employers have to aware the limitation of people with
DISCUSSION

The samples of the study are purposely chosen to be varied in order to obtain the view of employment trend among disabilities from multiple perspective. The samples consist of people with various type of disabilities, working population with and without disabilities and employers (Table IV). The employment of people with disabilities are found to be presence in all the journals discussed.

Acceptance in employment of disabilities

Despite of previous report regarding low rate in employment of people with disabilities, the current trend of hiring disabled people is being improved. The employers are starting to recognize the disabilities as functional workers (10). There is also new project being tested to create for better employment opportunities for the disabilities (16).

The pattern of employment shows that people with disabilities in term of mental illness, psychological disability or intellectual disability is less being employed (21,23). Very few number of organizations are progressing on the policies at their workplace regarding hiring people with mental illness. This might due to the Act on Disability that did not stress on any type of disability to be recruited (19). Other reason could be the employers have minimal knowledge about people with this type of disability thus they do not know their capabilities in working.

Meanwhile, other type of disabilities like physical disability, communicational disability, sensory disability are continued to being employed. In fact, some of the employers have awareness and knowledge about disabled people thus, they make suitable modification in the mode of work and social support for the physically disabled employees (7,11).

Based on the pattern of employment, there is element of acceptance in employing people with disabilities among employers because some employers do practice the equality in hiring workers. However, the type and severity level of the disability do play an important role for employers to provide employment to disabled people.

Fairness or discrimination in employment of disabilities

The trend of employment in people with disabilities is actually highly related with the factors that impact in chances of employment which can be seen in Table III. Most findings stated that the disability itself contribute in the chances of being employed either based on the type, the status, or the severity level (16,20,22). The findings of this factor aligned with the trend of employment of

the disability. Possible reason to this is because the disability properties somehow reflect on the ability of individual to perform work.

Work performance also being the popular factors among employers to offer the employment for people with disabilities. The employers concern on the working skill that individual possessed and line of work that the person can master (15,19). Besides that, the personality, the gender, the self-perception or self-estimation on working ability, age, ability to make choice, and level of education also being listed as the factors (Table III).

Discussing further on the employment opportunity in the concept of multiculturalism, there is possibility for the employers to be too reliable with the factors, which might trigger the stereotyping, pessimistic prediction, separatism and stigmatization (19). This create the unfairness and discrimination towards the minority group. So, it is important for the people without disabilities to have understanding and knowledge about this minority group so that more chances and opportunity can be provided to people with disabilities for employment.

Self-fulfillment among employees with disabilities

In addition, findings in Table III also listed out any suggestion and recommendation regarding ways to accommodate or adapt people with disabilities in the world of employment. This is important to maintain the employment status of the people with disabilities and to increase the rate of employment among them. It is also indirectly increases the quality of life of the individuals with disabilities.

In general, the practice of supportive work environment, training, job market that matched with the skills trained, the ability of disabled people to make a choice and sensitivity of employers toward making adjustment in the work setting can make the people feel satisfaction at work, feel important and adapt with the world of work. The adaptation at workplace is very important for people to feel like they have the space or medium for self-fulfillment.

Of all the recommendations and suggestions, the most important way in providing space for self-fulfillment among people with disabilities is by educating the employers as well as the other workers on the capability of the disabilities in performing work (19). By having a proper knowledge, the people can have awareness towards the disabilities and become more sensitive in making adjustment to the work setting that is more ‘disabilities-friendly’.

A good system in workplace is a condition that allow the people with disabilities to feel good and confident about themselves, allow them to participate spiritually and they can have sufficient financial gain from the
job they performed (16). Besides that, supportive work environment like appropriate monitoring and effective counselling support for the family with disabilities and specific needs (24-25), repeated learning process when new skills being introduced and proper workplace accommodation also can nurture the adaptation of people with disabilities at their workplace (21).

Other recommendation in making employees adapt in the world of work is through proper skills training and education. Yusof et al. (14) stated that the job that suit the type of skills trained by individual with disability can help in increasing their confident at work. Abdul Latib and Rajuddin (10) identified six employment core abilities skills (ECAS) that have influence in disabilities which are work productively, learning effectively, communicating clearly, act responsibly, thinking creatively and critically, and valuing self positively. By considering the ECAS, employers can provide suitable training and support that will assist them in the working place.

CONCLUSION

This review can shows that in general, people all over the world can accept this minority group in the work environment as the disabled people is continuously being employed. It means that the principle of multiculturalism is being practiced in providing the opportunity for employment. In order to get better view of the level of the acceptance, improvement can be done towards the study such as adding sample of colleagues of people with disabilities to obtain their view on their acceptance of this minority group in the work setting.

In offering the chances for employment, people need to apply the concept of equality, fairness and indiscrimination so that the criteria or factors in choosing for employees not being restricted. It is good to depends on the factors but flexibility in employment can provide better future for the minority group. Finally, it is everyone’s effort and responsibility to make the workplace adaptable for the people with disabilities. Thus, they can feel satisfaction and happiness because they are performing something that properly-used their abilities and talents.

Implication

In counseling field, the practice of multiculturalism is very important for the counselors. A counselor meets with variety of people with different gender, race, ethnicity, capability and many more. Based on the principle of unconditional self-regard, a counselor must ready to accept any client as a unique person without making any judgement to them. Similar to people with disabilities, a counselor needs to be able to understand this group of people so that when they come for a counseling session, they can feel like they are being accepted, treat in fairness, not being discriminate and counselor allows them to express themselves freely. This review can help a career counselor in better understanding about people with disabilities and providing them with better option to seek for employment. With the trend, factors and suggestions being discussed, the counselor can gives information about the world of work that are suitable for people with disabilities and helps them in making suitable decision for their career choice.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The research, publication or authorship of this title has no potential conflicts of interest and did not receive any financial support.

REFERENCES