

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19) Vaccination Policy as a Right or Obligation: Health Law Perspective

Prilian Cahyani, Didik Endro Purwoleksono

Criminal Law Unit, Departemen of Law, Faculty of Law, Airlangga University, 60286 Surabaya East Java, Indonesia

ABSTRACT

Introduction: The legal issue in this paper is the uncertainty regarding the recognition of the COVID-19 vaccination policy as a citizen's right or obligation. Vaccination is a medical procedure that provides a vaccine that stimulates the production of immunity in the body as a preventive measure. The vaccination program is an effort to realize the 3 SDGs. In Indonesia, the rules regarding health rights and obligations are regulated in the Health Law, but it is still not explicitly regulated in terms of vaccination, nor is vaccine approval legally regulated. Furthermore, the Outbreak Management Act provides legal consequences for anyone who refuses to be vaccinated because it is considered to hinder the control of the epidemic. This paper analyses the categories of rights and obligations. **Methods:** This research applies normative legal research while the legal approach and conceptual approach are used as approaches. **Results:** The implementation of the COVID-19 vaccine policy as a human right has an inherent obligation to humans. Therefore, in practice the implementation of the COVID-19 vaccine policy as a citizen's right, in the end cannot be implemented, even though it is based on individual beliefs because there are obligations that require someone to fulfill the rights of others including the right to health and criminal sanctions are imposed if not implemented. **conclusions:** This research shows that the Covid-19 vaccination policy in Indonesia is not only a human right but also an obligation. So that criminal sanctions arise for people who do not implement them.

Keywords: Plague, Covid-19, Vaccination, Vaccine policy and Health

Corresponding Author:

Prilian Cahyani, M.H.

Email: prillian@fh.unair.ac.id

Tel: +62-81 357 23338

INTRODUCTION

The Indonesian government has issued a vaccination policy for Covid-19. Vaccination is a scientifically accepted effort in the field of public health to prevent infectious diseases in an effective and efficient manner. Vaccination is a type of active immunization that involves administering a vaccine. Historically, immunization has been successful in preventing outbreaks of disease, disability, and death, such as smallpox, polio, tuberculosis, hepatitis B, diphtheria, measles, rubella, tetanus, pneumonia, meningitis, and cervical cancer (18). The program supports the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 3 on

good health and well-being, particularly in the context of ending communicable diseases.

Vaccination policies incorporate the concept of immunity. Immunity consists of individual immunity and herd immunity. Herd immunity can be achieved if vaccination is carried out evenly throughout the region. The occurrence of immunity in most vaccine targets will result in protection for other age groups. In the end, vaccination of infectious diseases will prevent rapid spread and outbreaks. This is the basis for vaccination policies because by implementing policies on vulnerable groups, people will be protected from infectious diseases (18).

In Indonesia, the regulation of health is regulated in the Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 36 of 2009 concerning Health (25). The law regulates the rights and obligations of Indonesian citizens in the

health sector, but the categories themselves have not been further elaborated. The Health Act also does not regulate vaccination. Therefore, legally, vaccines have not been clearly classified as rights or obligations in the health sector. This is a legal problem because both have different legal implications.

As a form of active immunization, the implementation of the Covid-19 vaccination is regulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Indonesia Number 84 of 2020 concerning the Implementation of Vaccination in the Context of Eradicating the Corona Virus Disease 2019 (Covid19) Pandemic. Vaccination aims to reduce the spread of Covid-19, reduce morbidity and mortality due to COVID-19, gain group immunity in society, and protect the community from COVID-19 so that people can live productively socially and economically (13). The problem that will be analysed in this article is the covid-19 vaccination as a right or an obligation.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Normative legal research is carried out in this study, where this research uses positive legal arrangements or statutory regulations as the most essential reference to solve legal problems that arise and have caused tension in the reality of life in society. Peter Machmud Marzuki, Professor of Law from the Faculty of Law, Universitas Airlangga, in his book entitled Legal Research, clearly states that Social Legal Research is not a form of Legal Research. So, the research team in the context of this legal research does not use the following Legal Social Research and its rules are certainly not used in this legal research (16).

The statutes and conceptual approach are applied in this research. Legislative approach (statute approach), namely in this approach the author conducts research, will find, investigate and understand the laws and regulations relating to the case (16). Therefore, the author feels the need to use the conceptual concept of the concept of rights and obligations (16).

RESULTS

Shifting the implementation of the Covid-19 vaccination policy as a right to an obligation

The Covid-19 vaccination policy is a human right. These rights and obligations are inherent and integrated in the regulations. Human rights include individual or collective rights. Thus, the implementation of human rights basically also recognizes the obligation to uphold and respect other people. The implementation of the COVID-19 vaccine policy as a human right has an inherent obligation to humans. Therefore, in practice the implementation of the COVID-19 vaccine policy as a citizen's right, in the end it cannot be implemented, even though it is based on individual beliefs because

there are obligations that require someone to fulfill the rights of others, including it. right to health.

The imposition of criminal sanctions on people who do not carry out the Covid-19 vaccination

In Indonesia, the relevant laws and regulations in the health sector regulate rights and obligations, but do not elaborate further on the categories contained in the rights and obligations. Thus, vaccines are not included in the category of rights or obligations in legal aspects. However, the regulation of epidemic control as regulated in the relevant law regulates immunity efforts including vaccines whose implementation has been determined and will be subject to criminal sanctions if they are not implemented. This shows that the Indonesian provisions do not meet the principle of coherence which demands consistency between one law and another (16).

DISCUSSION

The principle of human rights is a right that humans have from birth in this world. Human rights are not given to humans by society or based on positive law, but solely based on their dignity as human beings (8). Everyone is born with the same status, rights and freedoms without any discrimination or exception. Everyone has the right to life, liberty and security (17). In addition, it is not permissible to make judgments based on the political, legal, or global standing of the country or territory to which a person belongs, whether from an independent country, in the form of a trusteeship, colony, or under a border. other sovereignty (17). This is the universal nature of these rights, without prejudice to the limitations of one human rights to another.

In general, human rights aim to establish general rules in the constitutional system and legislation (23). It cannot be separated from society; therefore, it is necessary to harmonize rights between individuals and other individuals in the form of legislation so as to create an orderly and orderly community life. As a result, the rule is legitimized by society and recognized as law (5). Behaviour in social life also needs to be regulated because compliance and law enforcement cannot be left to each other's freedom (21).

The health sector is one of the fundamental and significant needs for humans. Everyone has the right to be healthy and is bound to maintain his health. Health is a condition in which a person feels healthy physically, psychologically, and spiritually as a whole, so that a person can live socially and economically productive. According to the World Health Organization (WHO), health is a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being and not merely the absence of disease or other disease. A healthy lifestyle affects the health of the body, which is significant because it improves the quality and quantity of life in society.

The basis for the legitimacy of the right to health is regulated in national and international law. The regulation on the right to health is contained in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, in particular Article 25 which states that: Everyone has the right to a standard of living adequate for the health and well-being of himself and his family, including food, clothing and housing, housing and necessary medical care and social services and the right to security in the event of unemployment, sickness, disability, widowhood, old age or other lack of livelihood in circumstances beyond his control. Therefore, WHO views that the state has an obligation to public health. As stated that,

Because there is a right to health, there are rules as guidelines and limits so that there is no arbitrariness from certain parties, that rule is the health law. Health law is the entire legislation relating to the health sector, both in the fields of civil law, criminal law, and administrative law. The national health system is also expected to guide each development of health actors. In accordance with Article 1 number 2 of Presidential Regulation Number 72 of 2012 concerning Health Systems, the National Health System ("SJSN") is the administration of health carried out by all components of Indonesian society in an integrated and mutually supportive manner to ensure the achievement of the highest degree of public health. The development of the health sector is carried out by all components of the nation so that there is an increase in awareness, willingness, and ability to live healthy for everyone and achieve the highest degree of public health (7). Development in the health sector is carried out to realize a national health system. Improving health can be an investment to support economic development because it plays an important role in overcoming poverty (17).

Health development can be achieved through health efforts, including the prevention of infectious diseases. The purpose of controlling infectious diseases is to realize the community's right to live a healthy life as mandated in Article 28 H paragraph 1 of the 2nd Amendment to the 1945 Constitution, which subsequently becomes the philosophical basis for healthy development. Human Rights are basic rights that are owned by every person as a human (24). Practically, human rights do not have unlimited freedom. The implementation of human rights is limited by the party who has the authority, namely the government. Restricted human rights are rights that involve actions that are prohibited because they are contrary to the nature of human rights (9).

Every individual has a basic right to health. Health is described as a state of physical, mental, spiritual and social well-being that enables everyone to lead a productive social and economic life (24). Promotive health services, preventive health services, curative health services, and rehabilitative health services are implemented to achieve the highest level of health.

Philosophically, the origin of human rights begins with the concept of natural rights which is derived from natural law (19). The concept of recognizing human rights is based on natural law. Natural law expresses basic principles about the nature of law and justice. The evolution of the concept of human rights until the French Revolution gave rise to the Declaration of Human Rights in the 'Declaration des droits de l'homme et du citoyen' (19). Until the end of World War II, scholars recognized the value of human rights until an agreement on the recognition of human rights was born in the Universal Declaration Human rights.

The theoretical development of human rights has shifted from an emphasis on vertical relations to an emphasis on horizontal relations. Vertically, violations of human rights are seen from the perspective that the state is the party responsible for violations that occur, including in the economic, social, and cultural fields (19). As a result, the government must offer protection and enforcement of human rights. In contrast to the horizontal notion of human rights, it leads to an increase in categories and actors of human rights violators (19). For example, the right to information is not solely a government obligation, but is also an obligation for companies whose activities overlap with people's lives. The progress of the recognition of human rights is related to the regulation of human rights both at the international and national levels. As a result, human rights regulations become formal and materially comprehensive (4). The emergence of the concept of universal application of human rights gave birth to the view that human rights naturally apply universally, in contrast to the view which states that human rights apply in certain cases, all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives. The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adheres to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, result in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. The emergence of the concept of universal application of human rights gave birth to the view that human rights naturally apply universally, in contrast to the view which states that human rights apply in certain cases, all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives. The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. The emergence of the concept of universal application of human rights gave birth to the view that human rights naturally apply universally, in contrast to the view which states that human rights apply in certain cases, all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives. The existence of regulations on human

rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives (4). The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adheres to a relatively particularistic view with regard to national problems, resulting in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives (4). The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adheres to a relatively particularistic view with regard to national problems, resulting in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives (4). The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. and who hold a relatively particularistic view with regard to national problems, resulting in the

enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives (4). The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adheres to a relatively particularistic view with regard to national problems, resulting in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. all of which are separated into absolute and relative perspectives (4). The existence of regulations on human rights in the health sector that are absolute universal, so that international health regulations apply in Indonesia, and which adhere to a relatively particularistic view by taking into account national problems, have resulted in the enactment of these international regulations. according to the cultural situation. and who hold a relatively particularistic view with regard to national problems, resulting in the

Justice is an essential value in the legal system. Justice must be prioritized in the implementation of the law. Justice is a value that aims to build an ideal relationship between humans as members of society by recognizing people based on their achievements and imposing obligations based on law and morals (15). This is based on the views of several experts, including Plato, Roscoe Pound, and John Rawls. Although justice is a vague concept, it cannot be denied that everyone craves for it (19). Likewise, health, as a right, must be equitably distributed. As a result, the justice that is embraced in health services is distributive justice (2). According to Beauchamp and Childress, data on distributive justice is achieved when justice is given to each individual based on his needs (2). Regarding the covid-19 vaccination program, it would be better if it was based on need. According to the Minister of Health's Regulation on Covid-19 Vaccination, those who will receive priority in getting the vaccine have been classified based on their needs. According to the regulation, health workers are given first priority in receiving immunizations.

Rights and obligations are attached to the law and incorporated in it (1). In practice, the law regulates not only the individual's relationship with society, but also the individual's relationship with the environment and society as a whole. As a result, human rights are divided into two categories: individual rights and communal human rights (1). As a result, not only is the fulfillment of human rights necessary, but there is also a human need to uphold and respect the human rights of others. However, in a legal environment, if someone is accused of violating another person's human rights, it must be based on the applicable laws and regulations. As a result, the implementation of the Covid-19 vaccine policy as a

human right contains a human obligation. Furthermore, although participation in COVID-19 vaccine policy is a citizen's right, it cannot be done completely in practice, even if it is based on individual views. Because there is a human obligation that requires someone to fulfil the rights of others, which in this case includes the right to health.

The rule of law is a way of life that regulates how people should act and behave in society to protect their own interests and those of others (12). Legal regulations are classified into orders, prohibitions, and permits based on their contents (12). By their nature, legal norms can be separated into coercive imperative rules and complementary facultative ways (12).

The legal system, as a kind of collective agreement, becomes very important in regulating Indonesia and its pluralistic society. Certain rules that are applied and mutually agreed upon as a nation and state-society make a person unable to violate the applicable regulations even though the violation is in line with his belief or group (3).

In Indonesia, as a welfare state, the state is responsible for realizing the welfare of its people, especially by interfering in the activities of its residents. To achieve the highest degree of health, one form of government action for the benefit of the population is in the health sector (6). The following principles must be followed to fulfil the right to health: a) Availability of health services; b) Accessibility; c) Receipt; and d) Quality (6). Furthermore, the policy is used to fulfill the government's commitment in fulfilling the right to health. The following principles should guide government policy: a) recognize the right to health; b) protect the right to health; and c) fulfillment of the right to health (6).

The right to health related to the COVID-19 outbreak is included in the discussion of fundamental social rights. As previously mentioned, basic social rights are based on the right to health care which is linked to human nature not only as individuals but also as social beings (9).

The Covid-19 vaccination policy aims to fulfill the right to health because it holds basic social and individual rights. Fundamental social rights include the right to health care (10). While the basic rights of individuals are determined by the right to self-determination, the right to information (10). These basic rights are one of the elements of prosperity that must be achieved by Indonesia as regulated in Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia.

Regulation of the health sector in the form of legislation is a manifestation of Indonesia as a state of law. The rule of law and human rights cannot be separated, because human rights are protected in the rule of

law (14). If a country's human rights are ignored or intentionally violated, causing irreparable suffering, then the state cannot be considered a rule of law (14). In addition to human rights, everyone has obligations and responsibilities based on their human nature. Human rights and obligations are respected in the rule of law (14). The enforcement of human rights is based on the principles of equality, the prohibition of discrimination, and a positive obligation to defend certain rights (20).

Law is intended to provide dispute resolution, a means of social control, a means of engineering, a means of community emancipation, a means of legitimacy, and as a controller of change or as a distribution of justice (22). Human rights in the health sector are embodied in the health law. In Indonesia, provisions on health, epidemic control, and vaccination have been regulated to deal with the COVID-19 pandemic. This is to make it happen. legal certainty. Legal certainty, according to Sudikno Mertokusumo, is the certainty that the law is carried out correctly by utilizing the regulations made by the authorities; therefore, these rules have a juridical component that provides legal certainty to function as regulations that must be respected (25).

Legal issues regarding the right to health are also correlated with individual rights. Individual rights are based on the right to information and the right to self-determination (9). These rights specifically relate to the relationship between doctors and patients. Based on the results of laboratory tests, patients infected with COVID-19 have the right to obtain complete information about their illness and the medical action to be taken. This is related to the rights and obligations of patients as regulated in Law no. 29 of 2004 concerning Medical Practice, hereinafter referred to as the "Medical Practice Law", is specifically intended for patients 52 and patients 53. Likewise, the right to self-determination for patients has also been recognized in Article 52 of the Medical Practice Act.

The right to health must be respected. As a form of legal protection, anyone who violates the fulfillment of this right is subject to sanctions. Violation of human rights as referred to in Article 1 point (6) means: Every act by an individual or group of individuals, including state apparatus, whether intentional or unintentional, which unlawfully reduces, suppresses, restricts, and/or revokes the human rights of an individual or group of individuals guaranteed by the provisions regulated in this law, and who do not or cannot obtain fair and comprehensive compensation according to the applicable legal mechanism. This provision emphasizes the violation of rights which is done either intentionally or due to negligence.

As mentioned above, rights and obligations are inherent in the law. The actual form of law is statutory provisions. In Indonesia, the right to health has been regulated in

legislation that embodies the protection of the right to health. Based on the laws and regulations in the health sector, immunization including but not limited to active immunization is the right of citizens. Vaccine policy refers to the provisions related to outbreaks that regulate one of the efforts to overcome the outbreak through the immune process. In this case the vaccine policy can be categorized as a process of immunity against infectious diseases. Furthermore, article 14 stipulates that anyone who prevents efforts to overcome the pandemic will be subject to criminal sanctions.

In Indonesia, the legal basis for controlling the epidemic is Law Number 4 of 1984 concerning Outbreaks of Infectious Diseases. Efforts to control the epidemic as regulated include epidemiological investigations; examination, treatment, care, and isolation of patients, including quarantine measures; evasion and immunity; extermination of the cause of the disease; treatment of corpses due to epidemics; socialization to the public; and other countermeasures (23). Based on these provisions, it becomes the basis for carrying out all epidemic control measures in the form of prevention and protection, including vaccination. Furthermore, it is regulated that those who hinder the implementation of epidemic control will be punished with criminal sanctions (23). Therefore, the arrangement raises the question of whether vaccination is a right or an obligation.

In the application of criminal sanctions, human rights include the principle of *ultimum remedium* (23). Any implementation that does not carry out a selective assessment may violate human rights (23). If not, criminal sanctions as an *ultimum remedium* are needed to guarantee violations of human rights by other parties.

CONCLUSION

This research shows that the Covid-19 vaccination policy in Indonesia is not only a human right but also an obligation. So that criminal sanctions arise for people who do not implement them.

ACKNOWLEDEMENT

The author would like to thank the UNAIR Faculty of Law institution for providing the opportunity for researchers to complete this research.

REFERENCES

1. Arief, Barda Nawawi. *An Collection of Criminal Law Policy Developments in the Drafting of the New Criminal Code Concept*. Jakarta: Prenada Media Group, 2015.
2. Bertens, K. *Biomedical Ethics*, Jakarta: Kanisius, 2011.
3. Berman Sitanggang, 'Fair Law in Indonesian Cultural Diversity Judging From HLA Hart's

Philosophy of Law', *Driyarkara Philosophy Journal*, 2012;3.

4. Effendi, Masyur and Taufani Sukmana Evandri. *HAM in Juridical, Social, Political Dimensions/ Dynamics*. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia, 2007.
5. Elvandari, Siksa. *Medical Dispute Resolution Law*. Yogyakarta: Thafa Media, 2015.
6. EW Yustina, *Right to Health Program in Health Insurance National'*, Unika Journal, 2016, Available from :http://journal.unika.ac.id/index.php/kh/article/viewFile/461/pdf_6
7. Is, Muhammad Sadi. *Health Law Ethics Theory and Its Application in Indonesia*. Jakarta: Kencana, 2015.
8. Jack, Donnelly. *Universal Human Rights in Theory and Practice*, Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2003.
9. Koeswadji, Hermin Hadiati. *Legal and Medical Problems*. Surabaya: Airlangga University Press, 1984.
10. Koeswadji, Hermin Hadiati. *Medical Law is the Study of Legal Relations in which the Doctor is a Party*. Jakarta: Citra Aditya Bakti, 1998.
11. Kurnia, Titon Slamet. *The Right to Optimal Health Degree as Human Rights in Indonesia*. Jakarta: Alumni, 2007.
12. Metokusumo, Sudikno. *An Introduction to Legal Inventions*. Yogyakarta,: Independence, 2009.
13. The Minister of Health. *The Minister of Health Regulation Number 84 of 2020 concerning Vaccination to Prevent the 2019 Corona Virus Disease (Covid-19) Pandemic*. The Minister of Health. 2019.
14. Nasution, Bahder Johan. *The State of Law and Human Rights*. Bandung: Mandar Maju, 2012.
15. Koeswadji, Hermin Hadiati. *Medical Law is the Study of Legal Relations in which the Doctor is a Party*. Jakarta: Citra Aditya Bakti, 1998.
16. Kurnia, Titon Slamet. *The Right to Optimal Health Degree as Human Rights in Indonesia*. Jakarta: Alumni, 2007.
17. Metokusumo, Sudikno. *An Introduction to Legal Inventions*. Yogyakarta,: Independence, 2009.
18. The Minister of Health. *The Minister of Health Regulation Number 84 of 2020 concerning Vaccination to Prevent the 2019 Corona Virus Disease (Covid-19) Pandemic*. The Minister of Health. 2019.
19. Nasution, Bahder Johan. *The State of Law and Human Rights*. Bandung: Mandar Maju, 2012.
20. Margono, H. *Principles of Justice, Benefits and Legal Certainty in Judge's Decisions*. Jakarta: Sinar Graphic, 2019.
21. Marzuki, Peter Mahmud. *Legal Research Revised Edition*. Jakarta: Prenada media group, 2016.
22. Indonesian Ministry of Health. *General Guidelines for the Healthy Indonesia Program*, Ministry of Health. Jakarta : Ministry of Health, 2016.

23. Indonesian Ministry of Health. Guide to Immunization during Covid-19. Jakarta: Ministry of Health, 2020.
24. Nasution, Bahder Johan. Law and Justice, Mandar Maju, Bandung, 2015.
25. Rhona KMHuman Rights Law. Yogyakarta: PUSHAM UII, 2008.
21. Sidharta, Bernad Arief, et al. Development of Theoretical Law Reflecting on the Constellation of Legal Disciplines, Yogyakarta: Logoz Publishing, 2014.
22. Sulistiyono, Adi. Addition to the Litgation Paradigm in Indonesia. Surakarta: UNS Press, 2006.
23. Santoso, Topo. Criminal Law An Introduction. Depok: Rajawali Press, 2020
24. The Indonesian House of Representative. The Law Number 4 of 1984 concerning Outbreaks of Infectious Diseases. Indonesia's Secretary of State. 1984.
25. The Indonesian House of Representative. The Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 36 Year 2009 concerning Health. Indonesia's Secretary of State. 2009.
26. Talib, Prawitra. Philosophy of Human Rights Law. Bandung: A Prosperous Conscience Tutotrial Facility, 2013.
27. Zainal, Asikin. Introduction to Indonesian Legal System. Jakarta: Rajawali Press, 2012.